A nearshore vertebrate assemblage from the late cretaceous (turonian) Atarque Sandstone, Socorro County, New Mexico

Justin A. Spielmann, Randy Pence, and Spencer G. Lucas, 2009, pp. 315-320

in:

This is one of many related papers that were included in the 2009 NMGS Fall Field Conference Guidebook.

Annual NMGS Fall Field Conference Guidebooks

Every fall since 1950, the New Mexico Geological Society (NMGS) has held an annual Fall Field Conference that explores some region of New Mexico (or surrounding states). Always well attended, these conferences provide a guidebook to participants. Besides detailed road logs, the guidebooks contain many well written, edited, and peer-reviewed geoscience papers. These books have set the national standard for geologic guidebooks and are an essential geologic reference for anyone working in or around New Mexico.

Free Downloads

NMGS has decided to make peer-reviewed papers from our Fall Field Conference guidebooks available for free download. Non-members will have access to guidebook papers two years after publication. Members have access to all papers. This is in keeping with our mission of promoting interest, research, and cooperation regarding geology in New Mexico. However, guidebook sales represent a significant proportion of our operating budget. Therefore, only research papers are available for download. Road logs, mini-papers, maps, stratigraphic charts, and other selected content are available only in the printed guidebooks.

Copyright Information

Publications of the New Mexico Geological Society, printed and electronic, are protected by the copyright laws of the United States. No material from the NMGS website, or printed and electronic publications, may be reprinted or redistributed without NMGS permission. Contact us for permission to reprint portions of any of our publications.

One printed copy of any materials from the NMGS website or our print and electronic publications may be made for individual use without our permission. Teachers and students may make unlimited copies for educational use. Any other use of these materials requires explicit permission.
This page is intentionally left blank to maintain order of facing pages.
A NEARSHORE VERTEBRATE ASSEMBLAGE FROM THE LATE CRETACEOUS (TURONIAN) ATARQUE SANDSTONE, SOCORRO COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

JUSTIN A. SPIELMANN, RANDY PENCE, AND SPENCER G. LUCAS
New Mexico Museum of Natural History and Science, 1801 Mountain Rd NW, Albuquerque, NM 87104

ABSTRACT—We have relocated and recollected the fossil vertebrate locality in the Upper Cretaceous (Turonian) Atarque Sandstone on the Sevilleta National Wildlife Refuge first documented by Baker and Wolberg in the 1980s. The locality (now NMMNH L-5153) yields numerous teeth and bone fragments from a localized, 0.7-m-thick intrabasinal ferruginous conglomerate composed of limestone, tooth, bone, bivalve shell and chert pebbles in a section of fine-grained sandstone near the top of the Atarque Sandstone. Virtually all of the teeth and bones from this bed were broken prior to fossilization, and based on the lithology of the bonebed and fossil preservation, we interpret this fossil site as an allochthonous assemblage in a storm deposit. The following selachian taxa were previously known to be present in this assemblage: Hybodus sp., Ptychodus whipplei, P. cf. P. mammilaris, Chiloscyllium greeni, Scapanorhynchus raphiodon, Cretolamna appendiculata, C. simplicatus, Chiloscyllium greeni, Scapanorhynchus raphiodon, Anomotodon sp., Rhombodus sp., Odontaspis parvidens, O. marcota, Plicatolamna arctica, Paranomodon sp., Rhinobatos sp., Ptychodus whipplei, and Ischyrhiza avonicola, I. mira, Ptychodurus triangularis and ?Rhombodus sp.

Williamson et al. (1993) re-evaluated many of Wolberg’s (1985a, b) identifications, based on Wolberg’s illustrated specimens, and modified the list of selachian taxa accordingly, resulting in less diversity than originally reported. This list of selachian taxa from NMMNH locality 5153 of Williamson et al. (1993) was incorporated into our faunal list (Table 1).

VERTEBRATE FAUNA

All of the vertebrate specimens collected from NMMNH locality 5153 exhibit various degrees of abrasion or damage, as noted below. Indeed, complete teeth are rare from the locality (Fig. 2), and only one specimen consists of associated teeth (NMMNH P-58064, Fig. 22). The abrasion and damage to the specimens is likely due to the high-energy depositional environment of the fossil-bearing bed. This vertebrate fossil assemblage can be divided into three components: chondrichthyan, osteichthyan and reptiles. Each component is discussed below separately based primarily on specimens at the NMMNH.

Chondrichthyan

Chondrichthyan remains are abundant at the site, with selachian teeth comprising the vast majority of the vertebrate fossils.

INTRODUCTION

Numerous marine fossil vertebrate localities are known from the Upper Cretaceous strata of New Mexico, notably concentrations of bone fragments and teeth, which were deposited in and along the margins of the Western Interior Seaway. These localities are generally selachian-dominated and contain a wide diversity of taxa. Here, we document additions to the fauna of a previously recognized locality (NMMNH [New Mexico Museum of Natural History] locality 5153) in the Atarque Sandstone, Socorro County, New Mexico, and discuss the paleoecology and depositional environment of the fossil site.

NMMNH L-5153 is in a 0.7-m-thick, localized, intrabasinal, ferruginous conglomerate of limestone, tooth, bone, bivalve shell and chert pebbles in a section of fine-grained sandstone near the top of the Atarque Sandstone (Fig. 1). The locality is on the Sevilleta National Wildlife Refuge, north of Palo Duro Canyon, Socorro County, NM. Exact locality data are stored in the NMMNH database. Specimens were collected as bulk matrix then processed chemically, using buffered acetic acid, and prepared mechanically at the NMMNH.

PREVIOUS STUDIES


Wolberg (1985a, b) first published NMMNH locality 5153, describing the extensive selachian-dominated fauna. Unfortunately, the specimens he described and illustrated have apparently been lost and thus are unavailable for restudy. Thus, the material we summarize and illustrate below are voucher specimens for this locality and are reposited in the NMMNH collection. Wolberg (1985a, b) described and illustrated the following taxa (using his original identifications): Hybodus sp., Ptychodus whipplei, P. anonimous, P. polygyrus, Squalicorax falcatus, Cretolamna appendiculata, C. simplicatus, Chiloscyllium greeni, Scapanorhynchus raphiodon, Anomotodon sp., Odontaspis parvidens, O. marcota, Plicatolamna arctica, Paranomodon sp., Rhinobatos sp., Ischyrhiza avonicola, I. mira, Ptychodurus triangularis and ?Rhombodus sp.

Williamson et al. (1993) re-evaluated many of Wolberg’s (1985a, b) identifications, based on Wolberg’s illustrated specimens, and modified the list of selachian taxa accordingly, resulting in less diversity than originally reported. This list of selachian taxa from NMMNH locality 5153 of Williamson et al. (1993) was incorporated into our faunal list (Table 1).
The following chondrichthyan taxa are now recognized from the site: Odontaspidae indet., cf. Leptostyrax sp., Scapanorhynchus raphiodon, Cretodus semplicatus, Cretolamna appendiculata, Squalicorax falcatus, Ischyrrhiza mira and Ptychotrygon triangularis.

Indeterminate chondrichthyan vertebral centra are rare from the locality, compared to the abundance of teeth (NMMNH P-58046, Fig. 2A-B). These vertebrae are elliptical, thin and are not identifiable to family-level. Their morphology is similar to that of lamniform sharks (e.g., Lucas et al., 1985; Blanco-Piñón et al., 2005).

Odontapsids are represented by incomplete teeth preserving only the main crown, without accessory cusplets (NMMNH P-58047 through P-58049, Fig. 2C-F). The presence of a lingual dental band and the sigmoid cusp profile identify these incomplete teeth as odontaspids, though the lack of cusplets and the incomplete roots prevent genus- or species-level identification. Large teeth have a crown height over 11 mm, and thus are larger than any of the odontaspid taxa reported by Welton and Farish (1993).

Teeth with triangular crowns and coarse striations, on both their labial and lingual sides, are assigned to cf. Leptostyrax sp.
A NEARSHORE VERTEBRATE ASSEMBLAGE FROM THE ATARQUE SANDSTONE

317

Given that *Leptostyrax* is diagnosed primarily by its root morphology, a definitive identification of our material is not possible. It should be noted that Williamson et al. (1993) illustrated similar teeth from roughly contemporaneous strata in northeastern Arizona as *cf. Leptostyrax* sp., though the coarse striations on the crown are more prominent in their material. The roots of *Scapanorhynchus raphiodon* are the most abundant (>90%) vertebrate fossils in the assemblage (NMMNH P-58051 through P-58054, Fig. 2I-L). As with many of the teeth in the assemblage, they are primarily isolated crowns (Fig. 2I-K), with specimens preserving portions of the root (Fig. 2L) being much less common. The high, narrow cusp and longitudinal striations extending almost to the apex of the crown identify the material as *Scapanorhynchus*, and the faint longitudinal striations are diagnostic of *S. raphiodon* (Welton and Farish, 1993).

Specimens of *Cretodus semiplicatus* are missing most of their crowns and preserve only their roots, cusplets and crown feet (NMMNH P-58055, Fig. 2M). Continuity of the cusplets with the root identify the specimens as *Cretodus*, and the relatively small size, strong longitudinal ridges on the crown foot and centralised lingual protuberance restrict this material to *C. semiplicatus*.

Teeth of *Cretolamna appendiculata* are incomplete, with only the crown, cusplets and small portions of the roots preserved (NMMNH P-58056 and P-58057, Fig. 2N-O). These specimens have smooth crowns and broad triangular cusplets, which identify them as *Cretolamna*, and their small size distinguishes them from *C. woodwardi*, with its distinctively more robust teeth. However, it is worth noting that the cusplets of our material are directed towards (Fig. 2N) or parallel to (Fig. 2O) the crown, which differs from all of the *Cretolamna* specimens illustrated by Welton and Farish (1993), which have cusplets directed away (either mesially or distally) from the crown. This difference in morphology may represent variability within the tooth row.

*Squalicorax falcatus* is represented in the assemblage by essentially complete teeth with distinctly weak serrations (NMMNH P-58058, Fig. 2P). The teeth are weakly convex, with a high crown and an anaulacorhizous root, thus identifying them as *S. falcatus*. Weakly serrated specimens of *Squalicorax* have been diagnosed by Shimada (2008) as *S. microserratodon*. However, compared to our specimens, the teeth of *S. microserratodon* are much smaller and have a backswept main cusp, with lower crown heights and a lesser angle between the distal cutting surface and root. We interpret the weak serrations of our specimens as a result of abrasion during deposition.

Rostral tooth root fragments of *Ischyrhiza mira* are present within NMMNH locality 5153 (NMMNH P-58059, Fig. 2Q-R). Root fragments identified as *I. mira* are robust with median longitudinal furrows and deeply scalloped lobes.

*Ptychotrygon triangularis* specimens from the locality are nearly complete (NMMNH P-58060, Fig. 2S-T). Three transverse ridges on the lingual face of the teeth in addition to the absence of smaller ridges and the higher, more pyramidal crown identify these teeth as *P. triangularis*. Additional specimens of *P. triangularis* collected from the site have had their transverse ridges abraded away, further indicating a very high-energy depositional setting.

A single microspiral heteropolar coprolite (NMMNH P-58066, Fig. 2B') is the only trace fossil collected from NMMNH locality 5351. The heteropolar morphology of this coprolite closely matches the helical anal valve of chondrichthyans (e.g., Williams, 1972).
scale is not similar to any amiid scales illustrated by Grande and Bemis (1998), which generally have fine, latitudinal striations and a more polygonal outline. Thus, we conclude that this scale pertains to a non-amiid teleost, but are unable to more precisely identify it.

Numerous conical, broad-crowned teeth lacking longitudinal striations (NMMNH P-58061 and P-58062, Fig. 2U-X) are identified as “Teleost B” of Shimada et al. (2006, fig. 14-13, 14-14), however, our teeth lack the transparent enameloid cap.

The most complete osteichthyan specimen from NMMNH locality 5153 is a partial dorsal pavement of a pycnodontid (NMMNH P-58064, Fig. 2Z). This pavement consists of three rows of teeth, with three large teeth in the most mesial row, six teeth in the middle row and six teeth in the most distal row. The three rows are from where the pavement presumably grades into numerous, smaller distal teeth. The three large teeth are elliptical, and weakly bicuspidate with a round lateral mound against the inferred lingual edge. The middle row of teeth are also elliptical, with a low, rounded cusp on the mesial margin and a prominent latitudinal groove running from the mesial cusp to the lateral margin. The distal row of teeth are rounded squares in outline, with a latitudinal groove in the center of the occlusal surface. Based on the greater than 1:1 ratio of number of middle row teeth to mesial row teeth this specimen appears more similar to “Coelodus brownii” than to “C. stantoni” (Stewart, 1900, pl. 24, fig. 12 to pl. 24, fig. 11). However, “C. brownii” does not appear to possess the latitudinal grooves on the middle row of teeth that are present in NMMNH P-58064.

The status of North American records of Coelodus is unclear. Currently, Coelodus is known only from Europe (J. Kriwet, written commun., 2009) following the taxonomic revision of the pycnodontiform fish by Poyato-Ariza and Wenz (2002). However, this revision is of pycnodontiform taxa for which articulated material is known, and does not include the Coelodus “tooth taxa” of Stewart (1900). NMMNH P-58064 conforms to the diagnosis of Coelodus by Poyato-Ariza and Wenz (2002, p. 222) as possessing “prearticular teeth extremely elongated, up to five times longer perpendicularly to the longitudinal axis of the bone” (or to phrase it differently, prearticular teeth five times wider than long) and appears similar to the illustrated holotype of Coelodus satumus (Poyato-Ariza and Wenz, 2002, fig. 22a). Given the uncertainty of the taxonomic placement of North American “Coelodus” we identify NMMNH P-58064 as aff. Coelodus.

Within the NMMNH sample there is a single tooth that we identify as Micropycnodon cf. M. kansasensis (NMMNH P-58065, Fig. 2A’). The tooth is roughly circular in occlusal outline and has a series of blunted mounds surrounding a central depression, very similar to teeth illustrated and discussed by Shimada et al. (2006, fig. 12.1). The occurrence of this taxon within the Turonian-age Atarque Sandstone is not surprising. The record reported by Shimada et al. (2006) is middle Cenomanian in age, and the holotype specimen is from a Coniacian deposit (Hibbard and Graffham, 1941), suggesting that this taxon has a stratigraphic range encompassing the lower half of the Upper Cretaceous.

Reptilia

Reptilian material in the assemblage at NMMNH L-5351 is rare, but critical to understanding the depositional environment of the locality. Only two taxa have been identified from the site in the NMMNH collection: turtles (Testudines) and theropod dinosaurs (dromaeosaurs).

The turtles at the locality are represented by isolated shell fragments (NMMNH P-58067 and NMMNH P-58068, Fig. 2C’-D’). There are two types of fragments: unornamented (Fig. 2C’) and ornamented with low branching ridges (Fig. 2D’). The unornamented fragments are similar to those of baenids, whereas the ornamented fragments resemble those of dermatemyids, common freshwater/terrestrial turtles of the Late Cretaceous (cf. Gilmore, 1935). The lack of complete carapace elements prevents even family-level identification.

A single dromaeosaurid tooth has been collected from NMMNH locality 5351 (NMMNH P-58069, Fig. 2E’). The tooth is weakly recurved and serrated on both its mesial and distal surface, thus pertaining to a theropod. Based on its size we identify it as a dromaeosaurid tooth. Overall, the tooth appears similar to a tooth published by Williamson (1997) as cf. Saurornitholestes, but with finer, less prominent denticles, which may be due to abrasion during deposition.

DEPOSITIONAL ENVIRONMENT

The Atarque Sandstone is a Turonian-age shoreline deposit of the Western Interior Seaway. All of the vertebrate material from NMMNH locality 5153 was collected from a conglomerate containing limestone clasts, tooth, bone, bivalve shell and chert pebbles in a section of fine-grained sandstone (Fig. 1, inset). This lithology indicates a high-energy deposit (the conglomerate) with reworked deep-water clasts (the limestone pebbles) within a nearshore environment (the sandstone). The site is most likely a lag deposit from a storm event; similar Upper Cretaceous selachian-dominated, transgressive lag deposits were reported by Williamson et al. (1993, p. 448). Taphonomically, nearly all of the fossil material is incomplete and/or has been significantly abraded, further indicating a high-energy environment. The energy needed to cause this amount of damage to these fossils, especially the broken crowns on many of the selachian teeth, further suggests that NMMNH locality 5351 is a storm deposit.

The fauna is indicative of a nearshore environment. The abundance of shallow littoral taxa, Scapanorhynchus and Psychotrygon, and the rarity of inferred deep-water taxa such as Ptychodus in the assemblage suggest a nearshore depositional setting (Meyer, 1974, p. 361-368). The presence of turtle material and a dromaeosaur tooth demonstrate a terrestrial influence in the deposit and thus proximity to the shoreline. Indeed, the few teeth of Ptychodus that Wolberg (1985) originally reported from the site may have been reworked from a farther offshore setting, much like the limestone pebbles. The Atarque vertebrate fossil assemblage thus corresponds well to the nearshore selachian association of Meyer
(1974), an observation consistent with the presence of terrestrial elements in the fossil assemblage and the sedimentology of the fossil-bearing bed.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Bruce Schumacher and Bruce Welton provided helpful reviews that improved the manuscript. Jürgen Kriwet, Kenshu Shimada and Francisco José Poyato-Ariza provided useful discussions regarding pycnodont identification. The Sevilleta National Wildlife Refuge allowed fossil collecting. Sally Williams provided field assistance.

REFERENCES

Wolberg, D.L., 1985b, Late Cretaceous (Turonian) selachians from the Atarque Sandstone Member of the Tres Hermanos Formation, Sevilleta Grant, Socorro County, New Mexico: New Mexico Geology, v. 7, p. 1-7.