Devonian conodonts in Arizona

R. L. Ethington, 1962, pp. 72-76


This is one of many related papers that were included in the 1962 NMGS Fall Field Conference Guidebook.

Annual NMGS Fall Field Conference Guidebooks

Every fall since 1950, the New Mexico Geological Society (NMGS) has held an annual Fall Field Conference that explores some region of New Mexico (or surrounding states). Always well attended, these conferences provide a guidebook to participants. Besides detailed road logs, the guidebooks contain many well written, edited, and peer-reviewed geoscience papers. These books have set the national standard for geologic guidebooks and are an essential geologic reference for anyone working in or around New Mexico.

Free Downloads

NMGS has decided to make peer-reviewed papers from our Fall Field Conference guidebooks available for free download. Non-members will have access to guidebook papers two years after publication. Members have access to all papers. This is in keeping with our mission of promoting interest, research, and cooperation regarding geology in New Mexico. However, guidebook sales represent a significant proportion of our operating budget. Therefore, only research papers are available for download. Road logs, mini-papers, maps, stratigraphic charts, and other selected content are available only in the printed guidebooks.

Copyright Information

Publications of the New Mexico Geological Society, printed and electronic, are protected by the copyright laws of the United States. No material from the NMGS website, or printed and electronic publications, may be reprinted or redistributed without NMGS permission. Contact us for permission to reprint portions of any of our publications.

One printed copy of any materials from the NMGS website or our print and electronic publications may be made for individual use without our permission. Teachers and students may make unlimited copies for educational use. Any other use of these materials requires explicit permission.
This page is intentionally left blank to maintain order of facing pages.
DEVONIAN CONODONTs IN ARIZONA

R. L. ETHINGTON
University of Missouri, Columbia

DEVONIAN STRATIGRAPHIC NOMENCLATURE

Occurrence of Devonian rocks in southern Arizona was reported by Williams (1903, p. 41), who compared fossils found along Pinal Creek north of Globe with the already well-known fauna at Rockford, Iowa. The following year the same author examined brachiopods collected from the section at Bisbee by F. L. Ransome and correlated them with the Rockford fauna and fossils from the basal Chemung of New York. He interpreted Theodossia [Spirifer] hungerfordi, which is common at Bisbee, as having close affinities with Spirifer anossofi, a Russian species which was then considered to be contemporaneous with the Middle Devonian index Stringoccephalus in central Europe. Williams therefore believed the beds at Bisbee to be of Middle Devonian age. Ransome (1923) and Stoyanow (1936) reevaluated this assignment in the light of more recent interpretations of the Russian species and decided upon an Upper Devonian age for the Arizona brachiopod fauna.

Ransome (1904, p. 33) used the name Martin Limestone for the Devonian beds of the Bisbee section. During the ensuing years, equivalent strata have been found to be widely distributed in the mountain ranges of south-central Arizona between the Mogollon Rim and the Mexican border. The Martin Formation is principally a carbonate sequence in the southern part of the state and maintains a relatively uniform thickness of the order of 375 feet in the various ranges where it is exposed. Toward central Arizona an increasingly high proportion of clastic material is admixed with the carbonate.

The brachiopod fauna, on which Upper Devonian age assignment was based, is restricted to the upper part of the formation. Stoyanow (1936) reported the occurrence of Camarotoechia endlichii, a characteristic fossil of the Percha Formation of New Mexico and the Ouray beds of the Four Corners region, above the strata containing Theodossia hungerfordi and Cyrtospirifer whitneyi in Peppersauce Canyon on the east side of the Santa Catalina Mountains near Tucson, and along Pinal Creek northwest of Globe. He suggested that these upper rocks be considered a separate formation which he named the Lower Ouray. Occurrence of Spirifer iowensis near the middle of the Devonian sequence at Superior, Arizona, has been recorded by Stoyanow. He also described abundant stromatoporoids from approximately the same horizon in the Picacho de Calera hills near Rillito, Arizona. Correlation of this lower portion of the Devonian strata of central Arizona with the Middle Devonian Cedar Valley Formation of Iowa was inferred, and Stoyanow proposed that these beds be set apart from the upper part of the section as the Picacho de Calera Formation. Most subsequent authors have rejected the Lower Ouray and Picacho de Calera of Stoyanow as formations, and instead considered them to be faunal zones within the Martin Formation.

Sabins (1957) described a carbonate and black shale sequence of Upper Devonian age which crops out along the east flank of the Chiricahua Mountains in southeastern Arizona. The black fissile shale member in the lower half of the formation is suggestive of the basal part of the Percha Formation, but, owing to the distance from the type area of the latter, the name Portal Formation was applied to the Arizona unit. Pye (1959) considered the Portal to be a local facies of the Percha.

Devonian beds in the Swisshelm and Pedregosa Mountains between Bisbee and the Chiricahua contain a high proportion of clastics. They were described as the Swisshelm Formation by Epis, Gilbert, and Langenheim (1957) who considered them to be equivalent to the Martin to the west, as well as to the combined Oñate, Sly Gap and Contadero of New Mexico. Absence of fossils typical of the Percha from the Arizona exposures was attributed to differences in facies. It was suggested that the Martin-Swisshelm, the Oñate-Sly Gap-Contadero sequence, and the Percha are areally distinct facies of a contemporaneous unit in which the Percha is a central basin deposit, whereas the others represent marginal phases.

Stoyanow (1936) believed that during late Devonian time central Arizona was occupied by a northeast-trending highland area of Precambrian rocks to which he gave the name Mazatzal Land. According to his interpretation the Martin sea advanced northwestward from southern Arizona toward this barrier only as far as the general vicinity of Roosevelt Lake. Devonian deposits near Payson, some 40 miles farther to the north, were considered to be deposits laid down in another sea which transgressed from the northwest toward Mazatzal Land. These strata were correlated with the Devonian sequence near Jerome and given the name Jerome Formation. Stoyanow concluded that the Martin Limestone, which he restricted to the portion of the Devonian succession at Bisbee containing the T. hungerfordi fauna, was equivalent to the fossiliferous upper part of his Jerome Formation. From a locality along the Verde River about 12 miles north of Jerome, Stoyanow also described 125 feet of strata containing a molluscan fauna which was not developed in the Devonian in other areas, and applied the name Island Mesa beds to them. It seems probable that only a local faunal zone within the Devonian sequence is represented and that a distinct stratigraphic designation is not warranted.

Huddle and Dobrovolny (1952) and Anderson and Creasey (1958) rejected Stoyanow's use of a separate formational name for the Devonian rocks north of Mazatzal Land. They applied the term Martin Formation for all Devonian strata in central Arizona south of the Mogollon Rim. McNair (1951) equated the Muddy Peak Limestone of the Virgin Mountains in extreme northwestern Arizona with the Devonian of the Jerome area. He considered these rocks to be laterally gradational in a northeasterly direction into the Temple Butte Limestone of the Grand Canyon region.

DEVONIAN CORRELATIONS

Most authors have correlated the Martin Formation with the early Upper Devonian Lime Creek (Hackberry) beds of northern Iowa owing to the common occurrence of brachiopods, particularly Theodossia hungerfordi (Hall) and Cyrtospirifer whitneyi (Hall), in both units. General equivalence to at least the lower part of the Chemung of New York has been reported (Cooper, et al., 1942). Merriam (1940) correlated the Martin strata containing the brachiopod fauna with the Cyrtospirifer zone of the Devils Gate Formation of Nevada. However, owing to the occurrence of Pachyphyllum in the Martin, he considered it to be only slightly younger than the lower zone of the Devils Gate.
Correlation of the entire Martin is questionable because the Theodlossia-Cyrtospirifer fauna is restricted to only a part of the carbonate sequence. In central Arizona, for example, it is found in only the upper fourth of the Martin strata. No fossils are known from the lower half of the unit in this area. However, as stated above, Stay-

anow based a correlation of lower Martin with the Cedar Valley Formation on the reported occurrence of Middle Devonian spirifers and stromatoporoids just above the middle of the formation.

Early reports (Ransome, 1916, 1923) considered the Martin fauna to suggest equivalence to the Percha Formation of New Mexico and the Ouray Formation of south-

western Colorado. Stayanow has demonstrated that characteristic Ouray-Percha species are present above limestone carrying the typical Martin brachiopods along Pinal Creek northwest of Globe, and in Peppersauce Canyon east of Tucson. That the Martin brachiopods are older than those of the Percha is further substantiated by Stain-

brook's (1947) report of discovery of a Percha fauna above the brachiopod-bearing beds in the Martin at the type locality near Bisbee.

The Portal Formation, described by Sabins in extreme southeastern Arizona, contains a high percentage of shale, particularly in the lower half of the unit. In this respect it resembles the Percha Shale. However, G. A. Cooper (in Sabins, 1957) interpreted a sparse brachiopod fauna from near the top of the Portal as being slightly older than typical Percha forms. Sabins therefore concluded that these strata are broadly equivalent to the Martin.

**DEVONIAN CONODONT LOCALITIES**

Carbonate samples from Devonian rocks collected at a number of localities in Arizona have been processed in acetic or formic acid and the residues examined for cono-

dants. Quantity of conodonts recovered varied widely among the several localities, and at none of them could these fossils be considered to occur in abundance. In this respect, the Arizona Devonian rocks differ markedly from approximately contemporaneous formations in the mid-

continent region in which abundant conodont faunas occur. However, sufficient numbers were found at three of the localities studied to provide representative conodont collections. In all cases the color of the specimens is jet black, apparently as a result of alteration. This may have accompanied the sulphide mineralization which has affec-
ted the limestones at all of the localities which were examined.

Collecting areas were as follows:

1.—The Devonian section along the west side of Pinal Creek, three miles northwest of Globe, is the one from which Williams reported Devonian brachiopods in Arizona. These strata were measured and described by Stauffer (1928), who also recorded an extensive faunal list. Stauffer placed the Mississippian-Devonian boundary at the base of a yellow, splintery shale. However, Stay-

anow found Camarotoechia endlichii in the 18 feet of yel-

low-gray, sugary dolomitic limestone above the shale, and correlated the shale and overlying beds with the Ouray and Percha.

The lower part of the exposure consists of buff-

weathering, thick-bedded dolomitic limestones which be-

come increasingly sandy about 100 feet above the base of the section. These beds do not contain megafossils and were not sampled at this locality. Beginning at the base of Stauffer's Unit 11, the fissiliferous portion of the out-

crop, rock specimens were taken at every lithologic change to the base of the yellow shale. Thick units were sampled at intervals to provide representative material. A total of 31 samples were collected, of which 23 contained at least some Devonian conodonts, although only four yielded any significant number.

Material collected at the top of the yellow shale was disaggregated by kerosene treatment and processed to be barren. The overlying yellow dolomitic strata were sampled at two-foot intervals and produced a few frag-

mented polygnathid conodonts. A thin, slabby layer, about an inch thick, at the contact between the yellow beds and the overlying gray, crinoidal limestone produced an abundance of somewhat crushed specimens of Siphono-

della. Limestone taken six inches higher in the Mississip-
pian rocks was barren.

2.—A complete section of the Martin Formation is well exposed on the north side of Queen Creek Canyon one-fourth mile east of Superior, Arizona. Material was collected at five-foot intervals from the top of the lowest quartzite near the middle of the formation to the base of the red fissile shale near the top of the unit. These strata comprise the Middle and Upper Members of the Martin Formation as described by Huddle and Dobrovolny. The lower portion of the sampled sequence includes the upper beds which Stayanow believed to be of Middle Devonian age. Conodonts were found in half of the specimens collected, although none of them produced any abundance. The lower 165 feet of Devonian strata at this locality con-

stitute the Lower Member of the Martin of Huddle and Dobrovolny, and the greater part of Stayanow's Lower Ouray Formation. These beds consist of gray, buff-

weathering, silty dolomitic limestone and are not known to contain fossils. Samples collected randomly through this part of the section proved to be totally barren of conodonts.

3.—Lithologic material collected at Black Gap, three miles southeast of Bisbee, near the type locality of the Martin, was almost all unproductive. No conodonts were found in those strata containing the abundant brachiopod and coral fauna on which correlation of the Martin strata has been based. This region has been intensely mineral-

ized, and all of the megafossils are almost completely silicified. Possibly conodonts were destroyed in the pro-

cess, if they ever were present in these rocks. A number of limestone blocks collected from exposures of fossilifer-

ous Martin in road cuts in the Bisbee area also were totally devoid of conodonts.

4.—Sabins reported the occurrence of several cono-
dont genera in the lower member of his Portal Formation at Blue Mountain, on the east side of the Chiricahua Moun-
tains. Rock collected at two-foot intervals contained cono-
dants only in the upper 36 feet of this member. The re-

mainder of the unit, which becomes increasingly shaly toward its base, is barren as are the other three members of the Portal Formation at this locality.

5.—Devonian corals are abundant in reddish, dolo-
mitic limestone at the quarry a half mile north of the Dia-

mond Point Fire Control Tower, 11 miles east of Payson, Arizona. Lithologic material from this quarry did not pro-
duce conodonts. Random collections from the Martin ex-

posures on the slope north of Sycamore Creek, a mile west of the East Verde River bridge on the Pine-Payson highway, were also unproductive. Possibly very systematic sampling of the Devonian at the latter locality would provide a conodont fauna.
CONODONTS OF THE MARTIN AND PORTAL FORMATIONS

Occurrences of conodonts seem to be rather sporadic in the Devonian of Arizona. Only three of the collecting sites from which samples were taken produced significant numbers of specimens. Frequency of occurrence varies considerably between successive lithologies within individual outcrops, and even within individual layers. Resampling of the more productive horizons determined by the initial collection at the Pinal Creek locality in general failed to produce additional specimens. It therefore appears that conodonts occur only locally within the strata, rather than being uniformly distributed. Possibly local current conditions on the sea floor at the time of deposition resulted in such concentrations.

Faunal lists for the Martin and Portal Formations are shown below. At each of the localities, species of Polygnathus exceed all other faunal elements combined in number of specimens.

**Martin Formation Along Pinal Creek North of Globe**

- Ancyrodella aff. A. buckeyensis Stauffer
- Apatognathus aff. A. varians Branson & Mehl
- Bryantodus camurus Huddle
- B. multidenti Ulrich & Bassler
- Ctenopolygnathus brevialmina (Branson & Mehl)
- C. iowaensis (Youngquist & Peterson)
- Falcondus secundus (Youngquist)
- Hindeodella acuta Branson & Mehl
- H. cf. H. subtilis Ulrich & Bassler
- Icriodus alternatus Branson & Mehl
- Ligonodina falciformis Branson & Mehl
- Lonchodina projecta Ulrich & Bassler
- L. aff. L. discreta Ulrich & Bassler
- Neoprioniodus sp.
- Ozarkodina cf. O. regularis Branson & Mehl
- Palmatelepis sp.
- Polygnathus linguiformis Hinde
- P. normalis Miller & Youngquist
- P. procer a Sannemann
- P. subserata Branson & Mehl
- P. unicornis Muller & Muller
- P. sp.
- Polygnathus? angulosa Stauffer
- Priioniodina prona (Huddle)
- Roundya aurita Sannemann
- R. robusta (Branson & Mehl)
- R. tumida (Branson & Mehl)

**Martin Formation at Superior**

- Hindeodella acuta Branson & Mehl
- H. subtilis Ulrich & Bassler
- Icriodus sp.
- Lonchodina sp.
- Neoprioniodus alatus (Hinde)
- Ozarkodina regularis Branson & Mehl
- Palmatelepis subrecta Miller & Youngquist
- Polygnathus normalis Miller & Youngquist
- P. procer a Sannemann
- P. aff. P. semicostata Branson & Mehl
- Priioniodina prona (Huddle)
- Roundya aurita Sannemann
- R. laminata (Branson & Mehl)
- Spathognathodus sp.

**Portal Formation at Blue Mountain**

- Ancyrodella aff. A. buckeyensis Stauffer
- Ancyrognathus amana Muller & Muller
- Avignathus? sp.
- Bryantodus sp.
- Hindeodella sp.
- Icriodus symmetricus Branson & Mehl
- I. aff. I. cornatus Sannemann
- Ligonodina delicata Branson & Mehl
- L. flexuosa Branson & Mehl
- Lonchodina robusta Branson & Mehl
- Neoprioniodus sp.
- Ozarkodina aff. O. plana (Huddle)
- O. sp.
- Palmatelella sp.
- Palmatelepis flabelligerformis Stauffer
- Polygnathus aff. P. normalis Miller & Youngquist
- Priioniodina powellensis (Stauffer)
- P. sp.
- Scutula? sp.

**STRATIGRAPHIC EVALUATION OF THE CONODONTS**

The conodonts of the Martin Formation are best developed in the Pinal Creek exposure, both in abundance of specimens and total number of species. Although frequency of occurrence is much less and fewer forms are present, the same fauna is represented at Superior. At both of these localities conodonts were found only in the upper half of the formation, and any inferences concerning age and correlation can be made only for those upper strata. No positive evidence was found for a Middle Devonian age for the lower Martin, as has been suggested by Stoyanow. The fossiliferous beds (Middle Martin of Huddle and Dobrovolny) at Superior, on which he based this interpretation, yielded only a few conodont specimens, all of which occur higher in the section associated with species of unquestionable Upper Devonian age.

The total collection indicates that at least the upper Martin beds were deposited during early Upper Devonian time, and represent part of the Marticoceras Stufe of the standard European Devonian section. Many species are long-ranging forms and have little stratigraphic value. Several forms are sufficiently restricted in their stratigraphic ranges to permit comparison with conodonts collected from other localities.

The conodonts from Blue Mountain are very similar to those from the Superior-Pinal Creek area, although only a few species occur at all localities. In particular, the occurrence of Palmatelepis subrecta in upper Martin at Superior, and the closely related Palmatelepis flabelligerformis in the basal member of the Portal at Blue Mountain, together with the common presence of Ancyrognathus buckeyensis, supports the correlation of these strata.

As has been demonstrated by Stoyanow, upper Martin of central Arizona is overlain by a thin unit which is the correlative of the Percha Shale of New Mexico. The few conodonts found in these layers north of Globe are fragmental polygnathids. Although not sufficiently diagnostic to permit precise temporal evaluation, these specimens appear to be typical of long-ranging Devonian species. Lack of abundance of conodonts is a character that seems to be common to the Percha equivalents throughout the southwest. Material examined by the writer from the Chaffee Formation of central Colorado, and from the Ouray Formation of the Four Corners region, both of which contain a Percha brachiopod fauna, yielded no conodonts. Additional collections from the Box Member of the Percha Formation at a locality 17 miles east of Silver City, New Mexico, produced only several polygnathids including P. linguiformis, a Spathognathodus, a Priioniodina and Hindeodella.
No conodonts were found above the lower member of the Portal Formation at Blue Mountain. However, the lithologies involved, a black fissile shale overlain by a carbonate section, suggest that these units are continuous with the Percha which is typically developed 100 miles to the northeast in New Mexico. Although much thinner, the same sequence of rock types is widespread at the top of the Devonian in central Arizona. Correlation of these strata is indicated in Figure 1. Although the characteristic shale is lacking in the Devonian at Bisbee, Stainbrook (1947, p. 298) reported the occurrence near the top of the section of brachiopods which characterize the Percha. Stainbrook concluded that the Percha brachiopods indicate Mississippian age. However, two specimens of *Palmatolepis rugosus*, an Upper Devonian conodont which is indicative of somewhat younger age than *Palmatolepis subrecta* which characterizes the Martin conodonts, were found a short distance below the base of the Escabrosa Formation at Black Gap near Bisbee. This is approximately the same horizon from which Stainbrook reported the Percha brachiopods. The few conodonts recovered from the Percha and its equivalents near Globe do not suggest Mississippian age for these strata. Furthermore, along Pinal Creek the Percha equivalent is immediately overlain by a thin layer rich in *Siphonodella*, a genus which Mehl (1960) considered to indicate the base of the Mississippian.

Clark and Becker (1960) have established a conodont zonation which they propose as a standard for the Great Basin. Presence of *Palmatolepis subrecta*, *Ancyrodella* and *Ctenopolygnathus* among the upper Martin-lower Portal conodonts indicates that these strata can be correlated with their Zone A which includes the lower Pilot Shale of western Utah, as well as part of the *Cyrtospirifer* Zone of the Devils Gate Formation in Nevada. *Palmatolepis* constitutes nearly 60 percent of the Devils Gate conodonts, whereas it is only sparingly represented among the forms at hand. No conodonts characteristic of Zone B of Clark and Becker were found in any of the Arizona collections. However, the presence of *Palmatolepis rugosus* near the top of the Devonian at Bisbee, and in the upper Pinyon Peak Limestone of Utah (Clark and Becker, footnote, p. 1667) suggests that the Percha and its correlations are equivalent to their Zone C.

Since it was first described, the megafauna of the Martin Formation has been compared with the Upper Devonian fossils of the *Cyrtospirifer whitneyi* Zone in the Lime Creek beds at Rockford, Iowa. Conodonts from the Iowa unit have been described by Bjoraker (1955). His report, together with collections made at Rockford by the author, indicates that conodonts are considerably more

---

**Figure 1.**—Conodont Zones in Arizona Devonian

(lithologies generalized)

R. L. Ethington 1962
abundant in the shaly Lime Creek beds than they are in the Arizona carbonates. Furthermore, the average size of individuals in the Iowa fauna is larger than that of their Arizona counterparts. Nevertheless the conodonts from the two regions are quite similar and serve to reinforce the long-standing correlation of the brachiopod-bearing part of the Martin and the Lime Creek.

A conodont zonation for the Devonian section of New York was described by Hass (1959). He reported *Palmatolespis subrecta* to be a zonal index for the Chemung. Its occurrence in the Martin at Superior constitutes further evidence for a Chemung age for this portion of the Arizona Devonian.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Early Upper Devonian conodonts characterized by *Palmatolespis subrecta*, *Ancyrodelia*, and an abundance of *Polygnathus* occur in the upper part of the Martin Formation in central Arizona, and near the base of the Portal Formation of the southeastern part of the state. Collectively these conodonts indicate that this is the same fauna which Clark and Becker designated as representing Zone A in the Upper Devonian of eastern Great Basin. The upper Martin-lower Portal strata are overlain by a shale and carbonate sequence which contains few conodonts, but which can be correlated with the Percha Formation of New Mexico on the basis of megafossils and similar lithologies. Occurrence of the basal Mississippian index *Siphonodella* immediately above these beds at Globe confirms their Upper Devonian age. No conodonts are known to occur in the lower half of the Devonian sequence of central Arizona. Whether these rocks should be considered to also be of Upper Devonian age, or assigned to the Middle Devonian as has been suggested, cannot be determined. The long-standing correlations of the Martin megafossils with brachiopods from the Lime Creek beds of Iowa and the Chemung of New York are supported by comparison of the respective conodonts.

**REFERENCES**


