Mining history of the Carthage coal field, Socorro County, New Mexico

Gretchen K. Hoffman and Joseph P. Hereford

in:

This is one of many related papers that were included in the 2009 NMGS Fall Field Conference Guidebook.

Annual NMGS Fall Field Conference Guidebooks

Every fall since 1950, the New Mexico Geological Society (NMGS) has held an annual Fall Field Conference that explores some region of New Mexico (or surrounding states). Always well attended, these conferences provide a guidebook to participants. Besides detailed road logs, the guidebooks contain many well written, edited, and peer-reviewed geoscience papers. These books have set the national standard for geologic guidebooks and are an essential geologic reference for anyone working in or around New Mexico.

Free Downloads

NMGS has decided to make peer-reviewed papers from our Fall Field Conference guidebooks available for free download. This is in keeping with our mission of promoting interest, research, and cooperation regarding geology in New Mexico. However, guidebook sales represent a significant proportion of our operating budget. Therefore, only research papers are available for download. Road logs, mini-papers, and other selected content are available only in print for recent guidebooks.

Copyright Information

Publications of the New Mexico Geological Society, printed and electronic, are protected by the copyright laws of the United States. No material from the NMGS website, or printed and electronic publications, may be reprinted or redistributed without NMGS permission. Contact us for permission to reprint portions of any of our publications.

One printed copy of any materials from the NMGS website or our print and electronic publications may be made for individual use without our permission. Teachers and students may make unlimited copies for educational use. Any other use of these materials requires explicit permission.
This page is intentionally left blank to maintain order of facing pages.
MINING HISTORY OF THE CARTHAGE COAL FIELD, SOCORRO COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

GRETCHEN K. HOFFMAN AND JOSEPH P. HEREFORD
New Mexico Bureau of Geology and Mineral Resources, 801 Leroy Place, Socorro, NM 87801, gretchen@gis.nmt.edu
P.O. Box 3542, Albuquerque, NM, 87190-3542, sshn212@gmail.com

ABSTRACT—The Carthage coal field in east-central Socorro County lies on the east flank of the Rio Grande Rift in a series of small fault blocks which contain the coal-bearing units. The Tres Hermanos and Crevasse Canyon Formations coal-bearing sequences both outcrop in the field but only the Crevasse Canyon has coal of minable thickness. This unit contains two coal seams ranging in thickness from 4 to 7 ft. The lower bed, called the Carthage seam, is the main source of coal extracted in the field, beginning in the 1860s. This seam is an excellent coking coal and relatively high in Btu value (12,531 Btu/lb). The proximity to southwest smelters in the 1880s and development of a rail spur connecting to the main line created the first surge of coal mining activity in the Carthage field. Carthage would experience several pulses of coal development until the late 1960s. Over 2 million short tons (st) of coal were produced from mines within the Carthage field from 1882-1963. The majority of the easily mined coal has been extracted from this field and the structure of the field does not lend itself to today’s large-scale mining.

INTRODUCTION

The Carthage coal field is located approximately 12 miles southeast of Socorro and 10 miles east of San Antonio, south of US Highway 380. Little or no mining activity has taken place for the past thirty plus years except for occasional interest by mining companies looking for new opportunities. Carthage is the site of the earliest sustained coal mining in the New Mexico territory and the field continued to have pulses of mining activity into the late 1960s. Many of these operations were plagued by land disputes, legal battles, struggles to maintain rail transportation, economics of the time, and by the complex geologic structure of the Carthage area.

The Carthage coal field encompasses about 10 square miles on the east flank of the Rio Grande rift, in a series of small fault blocks containing the coal-bearing units. Coal of minable thickness (4-7 ft) occurs in two seams in the Crevasse Canyon Formation. The Tres Hermanos Formation crops out in this field but the coal seams within this unit are rarely more than 2 ft thick (Osburn, 1983). This coal has excellent coking characteristics and is high-volatile C bituminous in rank (Hoffman, 1996).

Following the Mexican war, (1846-1848) New Mexico became a territory of the U.S. The Army needed fuel for blacksmiths stationed at the nearby territorial forts. The first use of coal from Carthage was in 1862 at Fort Craig, the earliest coal mine in the New Mexico territory operated on a sustained basis (Hereford, 2003). Carthage coal was used at Forts Bayard, Stanton, and Seldon. The mine was managed by Estanislao (spelling differs in references) Montoya, a brigadier-general of the New Mexico militia. He became a sutler (merchant supplying goods to the soldiers) at Fort Craig in 1872 and continued to supply coal in this capacity until 1877 (Haines, 1891). Montoya’s family lived in San Antonio and owned the land where the coal mine was located; Estanislao claimed the Carthage coal area was part of the Socorro Land Grant. The 1878 survey of the Socorro Land Grant did not include the coal area. However, the surveyor general was persuaded to order a new survey that did include the Carthage coal area. This decision played a role in coal development of this area in the 1880s.

The Santa Fe Railroad became interested in the Carthage coal area while expanding its railroad lines into the New Mexico Territory after the Civil War. The Santa Fe Railroad sent out surveys to discover feasible routes for railroads in 1877 and to look for coal and water to supply the trains. The railroad was also interested in coal that could produce coke to supply smelters in the southwest as a way to increase their profits. As a source of coal west of Glorieta Pass, the Santa Fe Railroad looked at the Cerillos area but decided to develop Carthage first (calling it San Pedro at this time) because of its proximity to southern markets and the coking quality of the coal.

SAN PEDRO COAL AND COKE COMPANY

Estanislao Montoya partnered with Thomas J. Peters in March 1881 to market and mine coal from the Carthage field. Thomas Peters was a former director and general manager for the Santa Fe Railroad. Papers were filed on July 26, 1881 to establish the San Pedro Coal and Coke Company as a subsidiary of the Santa Fe Railroad (Hereford, 2003). Montoya and Peters received 45% of San Pedro Coal and Coke Company stock (Fig. 1) and in return, Montoya and family conveyed 6 square miles encompassing the coal area to San Pedro Coal and Coke. To transport the coal from Carthage to the main line in San Antonio, the Santa Fe Railroad created a subsidiary company called the New Mexican Railroad. The New Mexican was incorporated January 12, 1882 but surveying for the branch was already underway. The railroad to Carthage, including a bridge across the Rio Grande east of San Antonio, was completed May 1, 1883 (R.L. Crump Archives, Carthage Branch, 2008). San Pedro Coal and Coke’s ultimate goal was to convert all of the coal mined into cokes and ship this product to local smelters in Socorro as well as other smelters in New Mexico, Arizona and Mexico (Mineral Resources of the U.S. 1883-1884, p.56).
The San Pedro Coal and Coke Company had an auspicious beginning with economical transportation in place and access to markets. A year before the rail line was completed (1882) the San Pedro mines (sec. 9, T5S, R2E; Fig. 2, Carthage No. 1) produced 16,321 short tons (st). The San Pedro mines extracted coal from a 4 to 4.5 ft seam in the Late Cretaceous Crevasse Canyon Formation. Twelve coke ovens were built in San Antonio in this year, but no production is recorded until 1883 (Mineral Resources of the U.S., Calendar Years 1883-1884). By 1884, 70 coke ovens had been built in San Antonio (Fig. 3) supplying coke to nearby smelters in Socorro and Arizona. The January 1, 1887 (p. 12) Engineering and Mining Journal reported shipments from two mines operating two shifts per day producing 250 st a day at Carthage. That year coke production totaled 13,710 st with an estimated value of $6.00/st (Mineral Resources of the U.S., 1883-1884). By 1884, these mines were extracting coal from the pillars and the No. 2 mine closed in 1893. The No. 1 mine continued to operate until August 1893 (Mine inspector for the Territory of New Mexico, 1894-1912). By then the coke ovens had been removed from San Antonio. San Pedro Coal and Coke had yearly production rates over 50,000 st from 1885 through 1892 (Fig. 4). The mine machinery and houses were moved from Carthage to Cerrillos in August 1893. The Santa Fe Railroad had reached an agreement with the owners of the Cerrillos coal field near Madrid, NM to replace the Carthage coal with that from Cerrillos. With this agreement in place, they made plans to abandon the branch line from San Antonio to Carthage.

Several factors led to the closure of these mines; the Carthage area is highly faulted with coal seams being displaced by several feet, making mining difficult (Fig. 2). The mine inspector reports the pillars were being mined, indicating the mine was not being extended; probably the coal seam pinched out due to depositional factors or offset by faulting. To continue producing coal the miners had to start taking coal from the pillars between the existing rooms. These conditions could have led to reports that the economic coal had been exhausted in the Carthage area (Gardner, 1910).

The economic circumstances at the time played a role in closing the San Pedro operation. During the previous decade of expansion, several sectors of the economy became overextended, leading to an economic downturn in 1893. Railroads, including the Santa Fe, major players in this expansion, suffered accordingly when the economy declined. The Santa Fe went into receivership on December 24, 1893. By December 12, 1895, the railroad had been reorganized as the Atchison Topeka and Santa Fe Railway (AT & SF) and the new company acquired San Pedro Coal and Coke’s outstanding stock. In March 1897, the AT &
FIGURE 2. Geologic map and location of mines in the Carthage coal field. North half of figure (above line) is from Chapin and Callender, 1983, Figure 1-60.55; geologic mapping by O.J. Anderson and J.C. Osburn. Mine locations are from the 1904 map of Carthage field, Southern Fuel Co. in NM Bureau of Geology mine map archives (1550) and from locations in Nickelson, 1979. Note Carthage No. 3 on map aliases- Hart, Soto, and Baca mine. SAF mine operated in 1902 by San Antonio Fuel Company - no production.
SF determined San Pedro Coal and Coke should be dissolved (Hereford, 2003). During the time of receivership and dissolution, little had been done to remove the tracks from San Antonio to Carthage. As part of the abandonment agreement with the territorial authorities, the Rio Grande bridge east of San Antonio was deeded to Socorro County (Hereford, 2003: Socorro County Records, Quit claim deed vol 42, folio 377). The rail line was officially abandoned February 20, 1896, but trains continued to operate as needed until May 30, 1897.

CARTHAGE COAL COMPANY

The next phase of coal mining at Carthage began in early 1894 with Austin Goodall and Felipe Portigliatti forming the Carthage Coal Company. They developed a mine 12 miles southeast of San Antonio in (NE ¼ sec. 15, T5S, R2E; location of Hilton mine on Fig. 2), east of the San Pedro Coal and Coke mines, and filed for a coal tract with the government. Because the Socorro Land Grant was under review, their filing was not approved. The validity of the Socorro Land Grant containing the coal acreage E. Montoya had claimed to be within the land grant was overturned in August 1899. The Surveyor General limited the boundaries of the confirmed grant to land actually settled and cultivated prior to Feb. 2, 1848 (Hereford, 2003). With this ruling, the Carthage coal area was added to the public domain.

During 1894, 486 st were mined at the Carthage Coal Company mine. Portigliatti and Goodall sold their interests in Carthage Coal Company (1895 or 1896) to Giacoma Lovera (Luerra) and Mary Hilton (August Hilton's wife; their son, Conrad, later prospered in the hotel industry). According to the Territorial Mine Inspector reports (Mine Inspector for the Territory of New Mexico, 1894-1911), the Carthage Coal Company mine was named the Carthage or Carthage No. 3 mine. This mine extracted coal from a 4.5 ft thick seam, probably the same seam mined at the San Pedro Coal and Coke mines within the Crevasse Canyon Formation. The territorial mine inspectors call this seam the Carthage coal seam. Coal from the Carthage Coal mine was transported by wagon 12 miles to the main railroad line at San Antonio. The New Mexico market for this coal included Socorro, Magdalena, Belen and Silver City; coal was also sent to El Paso, Texas, Arizona and Mexico. The Territorial mine inspector reported a weak market for Carthage coal in 1902 particularly in Texas because fuel oil from Beaumont Texas was being used in its place.

The Carthage Coal Company mine became the Hilton mine in 1903 (Fig. 2). This company operated two other mines, the Government mine (SW ¼, NW¼ sec. 15 T5S, R2E and NW ¼,
competing interests in the railroad and mines led to nearly two
to McMillan’s option (Hereford, 2003). The result of all these
This group also contracted to operate the Carthage mines, subject
by parties associated with the Victor Fuel Company of Colorado.
Two other railroads were incorporated with the same
ate of Charles B. Eddy, promoter of the New Mexico Railway
Grace Stackhouse of El Paso, Texas. Stackhouse was an associ
property. Duffy produced 2,507 st during 1901 and 1902 before
pute to the Socorro County District Court to eject Duffy from the
Disaster struck Carthage Fuel a second time when a fire began
due to coal dust ignition in the Government mine on February
22, 1918. The mine inspector called in the U.S. Bureau of Mines
safety team who had a rail car in Raton. The mine was sealed to
contain and extinguish the fire by the time the safety team arrived
on February 26. When the safety team along with the Dawson
mine manager and two other experienced miners from Raton tried
to enter the mine, they found the air was unsafe, killing a sparrow
they carried with them within 25 ft of the portal (State  Inspector
of Mines, 1918). One of the team (David Murphy, mine inspector
for Phelps Dodge at Dawson) that entered the mine to determine
the condition of the mine disarranged his breathing apparatus and
died from carbon monoxide poisoning (State Inspector of Mines,
1918, p. 18). It was not until March that the air was determined
to be safe and May 5 before the seal could be broken into the fire
area.
The Hilton and Bernal mines were mined out and closed in 1918. Finlay (1922) estimated that 40 acres of coal had been removed at each of these mines. Finlay (1922) also stated that it was difficult to extend the mine workings for these mines because of the complex faulting in the area, the dip of the seam (15°), and the cost of exploratory work to locate the minable seam in a new fault block.

The Government mine continued to operate until 1926 when all the pillars had been pulled within a few hundred feet of the portal and the equipment was removed (Mine Inspectors report, 1923, 1926). From 1922 to 1924, the mine inspector reported development work at a new mine called the Carthage No. 3 owned by Carthage Fuel. According to Nickelson (1979), the Carthage No. 3 mine is located in the SW ¼ sec. 10 T5S, R2E (Fig. 2) and produced 25,000 st. This mine and all Carthage Fuel Company operations ceased after 1925 (State Inspector of Mines, 1926).

**OTHER MINES IN THE CARTHAGE FIELD**

A few mines operated by other individuals or companies produced coal in Carthage and later Tokay, to the southwest of Carthage. E.O. Emerson and Charles Allaire opened the Emerson Allaire mine (sec. 9 and sec. 16, T5S, R2E; Fig. 2) in 1902. This mine opened a slope on a 6 ft-thick coal seam with a 20° dip in the Carthage coal seam in the Crevasse Canyon Formation. Production began in 1902 and coal was hauled by wagon to San Antonio for shipment by rail to towns in New Mexico and El Paso, Texas. In 1904, the Emerson mine closed the main slope because of a “squeeze”. This indicated a problem with the roof and/or floor expanding into the mine out area, probably because the supporting pillars or timbering were inadequate to hold the weight of the unsupported roof. This condition could have been complicated by the type of rock and or existing faults that diminished the competency of the rock. After closing the main slope two new slopes were opened, one driven in sandstone overlying the old main slope (Mine Inspector for the Territory of New Mexico, 1907). By 1908, the Emerson-Allaire mine installed a tram connecting to the New Mexico Midland railroad. The mine operated for a few more years, closing in 1916 with a total production of 128,036 st (Fig. 4).

The Kinney mine (sec. 17, T5S, R2E; Fig. 2) operated by B.H. Kinney opened in 1914 southwest of the Carthage Fuel Company mines. The dip of the coal seam was significantly less here (6° SW) than at the Carthage mines. Production began in 1915 with 1,600 st. A rail spur was laid from the mine to the New Mexico Midland line in 1917. Tipple and chutes were constructed and a water system installed the same year. In 1918, more dwellings for the miners were built near the mine and a post office was built establishing Tokay. Tokay was on the mesa above the Kinney mine, held up by resistant beds of the Gallup Sandstone. Coal from this mine like many others in the area was sold in El Paso.

In 1925, Mrs. Mabel Kinney applied for a prospecting permit for parts of secs. 20 and 21, T5S, R2E (Nickelson, 1979) to develop the No. 2 mine. This mine was developed on a 4 to 4.5 ft thick coal seam. This mine started producing coal in 1926; all production for the Kinney mines came from the No. 2 the following year. The pillars in the No. 1 mine had been pulled in the preceding year. Kinney opened three other mines, numbered 3-5. No. 4 was in sec. 17 (SE¼ NW¼, T5S, R2E) and No. 3 and 5 were in sec. 21 (SW¼ NW¼ T5S, R2E, Fig. 2). According to Nickelson (1979), No. 3 was a northeast continuation of the No. 2 mine. The Kinney No. 4 mine was opened in a wedge-shaped fault block near the boundary of the No. 1 mine. Approximately 8,600 st of coal were extracted from the No. 4 (Nickelson, 1979). The No. 5 mine was the last one to be owned and operated by Kinney. It was opened by driving two slopes through alluvium to intersect the coal along the eastern edge of the No. 3 mine workings.

Fuel oil and natural gas as well as hydroelectric power were taking the place of coal for home heating and power generation for many industries at this time (1928). El Paso now had oil and gas pipelines bringing fuel in from other parts of Texas significantly decreasing the demand for coal. These factors along with the Depression cut production by over 50% from 1927 to 1929(63,968 st, 29,761 st respectively). Production for the Kinney mine dropped further (8,676 st; Fig. 4) in 1930. J.E. Gilmore acquired the Kinney mine in late 1930 (Hereford, 2003). Coal from the Gilmore mine was sold in Albuquerque and the Socorro area and shipped by truck after the rail spur to Carthage stopped running trains. With the low production of coal from the Carthage field, the New Mexico Midland Railroad decided to cease operations August 28, 1931. They had been losing money since Carthage Fuel closed their mines in 1926 (Hereford, 2003). Gilmore continue to operate the mine through 1937 but Kinney repossessed the operation in 1939 and continued working the mine until December 1949 (State Inspector of Mines, 1949; Hereford, 2003).

Jack Hart acquired the old Hilton mine property (parts of sec. 10 and 15, T5S, R2E) opened as the Hart mine in 1935, and continued mining until 1939. Rafael Soto obtained the same mine in 1947 and operated it for one year at which time the property was sold to A.B. Baca. Baca mined coal at this location until 1968 (State Inspector of Mines, 1968). Coal from the Baca mine provided home heating fuel to the surrounding communities, and the public schools in Socorro (F. E. Kottlowski, personal commun. 1993) These operations, the Hart, Soto, and Baca, mined the coal left by the Carthage Fuel Company in between the faults and it appears the mine was north of the old Hilton mine (Nickelson, 1979, p.64; Fig. 2, Carthage No. 3). From 1945 to 1963, only 37,000 st were produced from the Carthage mines. The mine operated by Baca was called the Carthage mine or the Carthage No. 3 mine (State Mine Inspector reports, 1954-1966). Both of these names were originally used for the Hilton mine location when it was first opened by Carthage Coal Company, creating confusion in the location of these two mines. On Figure 2, The Carthage No. 3 is the location of the Baca, Soto, and Hart mine.

The last significant interest shown in the Carthage coal field occurred when Cactus Industries opened a coal mine, the Tres Hermanos, in 1980 (Martinez, 1981). However by 1981 it was no longer operating. The mine was to be a strip mine with 60,000 st production per year for eight years (Albuquerque Journal, December, 1979). Once development began, it was realized that the reserves had been overestimated (Martinez, 1981) and operations ceased.
MINING HISTORY OF THE CARTHAGE COAL FIELD

SUMMARY

From 1897-1944, 1.7 million st of coal were produced from the Carthage coal field; the San Pedro Coal and Coke, Carthage Coal/Carthage Fuel Company, and the Kinney mines all had years where production was over 60,000 st (Fig. 4). Total recorded production for the field is about 2.23 million st. This is a significant amount given the coal field’s limited extent and complex geology. The quality of the coal, access to rail facilities during most of the producing years and proximity to markets not served by any other coal areas created the opportunity for coal development in the Carthage area.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The first author would like to recognize Joe Hereford’s extensive research locating many obscure references. His compilation of this information in an articulate and interesting manuscript was invaluable in piecing together a more complete history of the coal mining at Carthage. Bob Eveleth was a great help in tracking down information and his wealth of knowledge of all things relating to mining in New Mexico was invaluable. Maureen Wilks supplied images from the photo and mine map archives at the New Mexico Bureau of Geology. Both Maureen and Bob suggested changes in the manuscript that helped to clarify and condense this article. Thanks to Leo Gabaldon for his help with the scanning and completion of Figure 2.

REFERENCES

Albuquerque Journal, December 18, 1979, State OKs Strip Mine Proposal, New Mexico Press Clipping Bureau, Albuquerque, NM.
Mine Inspector for the Territory of New Mexico, 1894-1911, Annual reports to the Secretary of the Interior.
Mineral Resources of the U.S. Calendar Years 1883-1884, Albert Williams, Jr., Washington Government printing offices, p 56, 170.
Osburn, J.C., 1983, Coal resources of Socorro County, New Mexico, Socorro Region II: New Mexico Geological Society, 34th Field Conference Guidebook, p. 223-226.
State Inspector of Mines, 1912-1968, Annual reports to the Governor of the State of New Mexico.